CASE NUMBER: RZ 19-02 LUP 19-01

REQUEST: Rezoning, Land Use Amendment, Variances

LOCATION: 75.29± Acre Tract Located Near Rosebud Road and Temple Johnson Road, Loganville

TAX PARCELS: 5093 106; 5094 161; 5099 180

CURRENT ZONING: RS-180 (Single-Family Residential)

REQUESTED ZONING: R-HOP(55)-SF (Single-Family Residential Housing for Older Persons)

CURRENT FUTURE LAND USE: Park/Recreation

REQUESTED FUTURE LAND USE: Low Density Residential

DEVELOPMENT/PROJECT: 257-Lot Age-Restricted Single-Family Detached Subdivision

APPLICANT: Patrick Malloy Companies, LLC
Atlanta, Georgia 30339

PROPERTY OWNER: Summit Chase Country Club, Inc.
Snellville, Georgia 30078

CONTACT: John Gaskin, VP Land Acquisition
770-319-5258 or MitchPeevy@gmail.com

RECOMMENDATION: Approval with Conditions
TO: The Planning Commission

MEETING DATE: April 23, 2019

FROM: Jason Thompson, Director
Department of Planning and Development

CASE NUMBER: RZ 19-02 LUP 19-01

FINDBINGS OF FACT:

The Department of Planning and Development has received applications from Patrick Malloy Companies, LLC, representing Summit Chase Country Club, Inc. to request a rezoning, land use plan amendment and variances for a 75.29± acre tract of property located in the southwestern portion of the city. The parcels border several different public roadways, including Rosebud Road, Temple Johnson Road, Classic Drive and Brushy Fork Road, among others.

The project site is the front nine (holes 1-9) of the Summit Chase Country Club, an 18-hole, par 72, 6,816 yard course that was designed by Ward Northrup and developed in 1973. The Golf Clubhouse facility and back nine (holes 10-18) are not included in this application and will not be redeveloped or altered as part
of this development. There is a 5.70± acre tract located at the intersection of Rosebud Road and Temple Johnson Road containing four lighted tennis courts that is not included in the rezoning application, but shown on the proposed site layout plan as Lots 258-280 and designated as ‘Future Phase’ of the proposed development.

The applicant is proposing to rezone the property from RS-180 (Single-Family Residence) District to R-HOP(55)-SF (Single-family Residential Housing for Older Persons) District as well as amend the 2040 Snellville Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use Map from Park/Recreation to Low Density Residential for the purpose of constructing a 257-lot age-restricted (55+) single-family detached residential subdivision, with a density of approximately 3.41 units per acre.

The master planned and covenant restricted community will be served by two gated entrances off Rosebud Road. There will be an amenity area including game rooms, a pool, kitchens, and athletic facilities including tennis and pickleball. There are existing golf cart paths throughout the site, including a golf cart tunnel under Rosebud Road. Many of these will remain for residents and golfers to have access to the remainder of the course.

There are a plethora of neighboring properties. The vast majority are low-density, single-family detached residential dwellings, zoned RS-180 and R-100. Many of these parcels belong to the various neighborhoods built around the golf course.
There are two (2) civic/commercial parcels that border the subject property to the north and west on Rosebud Road. The first is South Gwinnett Baptist Church, currently zoned Civic Institutional (CI). The other is TOMCO, which owns two parcels along Rosebud currently zoned Light Manufacturing (LM).

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting:

- To amend the City of Snellville Official Zoning Map from RS-180 (Single-Family Residence) District to R-HOP(55)-SF (Single-family Residential Housing for Older Persons) District.

- To amend the City of Snellville 2040 Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use Map from Park/Recreation to Low Density Residential.

In addition, the applicant is requesting the following variances from the R-HOP Design Standards:

1. Section 9.19, R-HOP(55)-SF District: Minimum side yard building setback of five-feet (5'), with a minimum of at least fifteen-feet (15') feet between buildings.

   Request to allow a minimum building separation of ten-feet (10') between buildings, measured at the foundation.

2. Section 9.18(1)(D), R-HOP Site and Architectural Design Standards: Homes/buildings shall be constructed of traditional design with brick, stone, masonry horizontal siding, and masonry shakes/shingles. Brick and/or stone shall constitute no less than seventy-percent (70%) of the materials used, with accents of masonry siding or shakes/shingles for each building elevation.

   Request to allow a percentage of proposed homes have the following building elevation configurations:
   a. Forty-five percent (45%) of the units shall have a front façade composed of cedar shake accent with three-foot (3’) masonry/brick water table. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.
   b. Forty-Five percent (45%) of the units shall have a front façade composed of cedar shake accent with thirty percent (30%) brick/masonry accent. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.
   c. Ten percent (10%) of the units shall have a front façade of cedar shake with seventy Percent (70%) brick/masonry. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.
PLANNING ANALYSIS:

Land Use Plan

The applicant proposes to amend the City of Snellville 2040 Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use Map designation from Park/Recreation to Low Density Residential. The change from Park/Recreation to Low-Density Residential may seem drastic, but this is only on paper. The requested R-HOP(55)-SF zoning district requires either a Low Density Residential land use, for single-family residential area of less than 4 units per acre or a Medium Density Residential land use, for single-family residential areas with 4 to 8 units per acre.

It should be emphasized that the proposed development is expected to come in at 3.41 units per acre, well below the 5.0 maximum units per acre allowed under the R-HOP(55)-SF district and below the 3.99 maximum units per acre allowed for the Low Density Residential land use.

The City of Snellville 2040 Comprehensive Plan Future Development Map places the proposed development in the Summit Chase Character Area, which consists primarily of low-density residential developments, estate residential, and park/recreation land uses.

The character area calls for the preservation of “green space and wooded areas”, which may at first seem at odds with the proposed development; however, it should be noted that the land this development will replace is largely a golf course, and not necessarily what the writers had in mind when referring to “green space.” While scenic, golf courses are single-use, and often restrict access to those not playing golf. As such, their utility to most nearby residents is much more limited than woodland, trails or other community-focused greenspace.
The applicant contends that residents of this new development will still have access to the club house and remaining golf course, as well as their own amenity areas.

Compliance with 2040 Comprehensive Plan

There are more than a few discussions and policy goals in reference to senior-focused housing in the 2040 Comprehensive Plan that recommend support for this application. A few are called out below:

- “Expanding housing opportunities for young professionals and seniors will support a multi-generational community…” ¹
- “With Snellville’s older population, demand for senior housing is growing. Of the 358 residential units currently under construction in planned communities in Snellville, 330 units are age-restricted for residents 55 and older.” ²
- H-3.1: Pursue more development opportunities focused on seniors and assisted living.” ³
- Focus on reinforcing neighborhood stability by encouraging more homeownership and maintenance or upgrade of existing properties.⁴

The findings and recommendations of the Snellville 2040 Comprehensive Plan indicate that the development of this property is in compliance with the policies of the City. The development of so much housing targeted at seniors is a stated need in the plan.

Zoning Map Amendment

In accordance with the submitted request to amend the land use plan, the applicant is also requesting to rezone the property from RS-180 (Single-Family Residence) District to R-HOP(55)-SF, (Single-family Residential Housing for Older Persons) District which is designed to serve the housing needs of adults who are 55 years of age or older. At least 80% of the occupied units/lots shall be occupied by at least one person who is 55 years of age or older.

R-HOP District Requirements

The following R-HOP District design standards shall apply:

A. Landscape strip(s) shall be provided on the property. The landscape strip may incorporate natural vegetation and shall be supplemented with a minimum of one of the following: 1) a landscaped berm (minimum of four-feet (4’) as measured from

---

¹ Executive Summary, vi.
² Section 2, Priority Issues and Opportunities, 16.
³ Section 4, Policies, Housing Policies, 28.
⁴ Section 5, Snellville Tomorrow, Summit Chase Character Area, 45.
the elevation of the public right-of-way, 2) wrought-iron style fence with brick or stone columns (30 feet on-center), or 3) a decorative brick wall. Alternate decorative fence materials may be utilized, subject to review and approval of the Director. Plantings shall comply with Article III, Landscape Ordinance of Chapter 19 of the City Code;

B. Street trees shall be planted in the right-of-way, in accordance with the details provided in Article IV, Tree Ordinance of Chapter 19 of the City Code. Street trees shall be planted no further than fifty-feet (50’) apart and no closer than twenty-five feet (25’) from street intersections. The City Arborist may approve alternate spacing when the fifty-foot (50’) spacing requirement cannot be met due to driveways and other improvements. All street trees must comply with requirements listed in the Tree Ordinance;

C. All grassed areas shall be sodded;

D. Homes/Buildings shall be constructed of traditional design with brick, stone, masonry horizontal siding, and masonry shakes/shingles. Brick and/or stone shall constitute no less than seventy percent (70%) of the materials used, with accents of masonry siding or shakes/shingles for each building elevation;⁵

E. All dwellings shall contain single-car garages, at a minimum, which may be attached or detached. All units with front-loaded garages shall have garage faces with decorative design treatments to enhance their appearances, i.e. carriage-style doors, window inserts, etc.;

F. Provide five-foot (5’) wide sidewalks and street trees adjacent to both sides of interior streets or private driveways;

G. A paved five-foot (5’) wide pathway/sidewalk system shall be constructed which connects outdoor amenities/recreation areas, homes, clubhouse, and other amenities;

H. A four-foot (4’) wide walkway, constructed of concrete or decorative pavers, shall extend from the sidewalk to the steps, stoop, or porch of all homes;

I. There shall be no open space requirement for developments in the R-HOP districts; and

J. Street lights within the subdivision shall be located seventy-five feet (75’) apart on average.

Dwellings shall be designed with the following standards:

A. All dwellings shall incorporate accessibility standards which shall include the following:
   1) A step-free feature to at least one entrance of the unit;
   2) 36-inch wide, clear passage doorways throughout the unit;
   3) Wheelchair, step-free access to the following areas, at a minimum: kitchen; dining area; entertainment area (e.g., living room/den, great room, etc.); at least one bedroom; at least one full bathroom; and laundry room with washer/dryer connection; and

⁵ Unless requested variance #2 is approved (see page 11)
4) The installation of full sheets of ¾” plywood, blocking and/or its equivalent in all bathrooms to allow for future installation, if necessary, of grab bars.

A mandatory homeowner’s association (HOA) shall be formed and incorporated which provides for common area building and grounds maintenance and repair (recreation, amenity area, and walking trails), insurance and working capital. Said association shall publish and adhere to policies and procedures that demonstrate that the community is intended to provide housing for persons 55 years of age and older including maintaining surveys or affidavits verifying compliance with 55 years of age and older occupancy requirements as permitted by 42 U.S.C. Section 3607, (b)(2)(c) of the Federal Fair Housing Act and implementing regulations. Said association shall provide an affirmative declaration to be governed by the “Georgia Property Owners’ Association Act’ (POA) and the applicable provisions of O.C.G.A. §44-3-220 Et. Seq. Said association shall also include declarations and bylaws including rules and regulations, which shall at a minimum, regulate and control the following:

A. Restriction on homes being occupied, with at least 80% of the occupied units occupied by at least one resident who is age 55 years of age or older;
B. Restrictions on persons under 18 years of age permanently residing in the community. Permanently residing in the community shall mean longer than 90 consecutive days in any 180-day period or establishing residency as defined by state or local law. However, the HOA shall provide for a hardship provision allowing for an owner/occupant to house and care for a child less than 18 year of age in situations where the owner/occupant assumes responsibility for caring for the child due to urgent circumstances stemming from actions not under the owner/occupant’s control. The association may, but is not required to, allow for hardship exceptions to this requirement;
C. Restrictions on single-family residential use only and leasing of units with no more than 10% of the total units may be leased by individual owners at any one time;
D. Except for a central amenity package, prohibit playground equipment, trampolines or like accessory structures or fixtures;
E. The HOA shall also provide that the covenants automatically renew at the end of the 20-year term, unless 100% of the owners at that time vote that the covenants should not renew; and
F. The HOA and/or community management association for the HOA shall give written notice to any grantee of the restrictions covered in this zoning at or before any sale or transfer of any property.

Covenants and Restrictions

Legally binding covenants and/or deed restrictions that run with the land shall apply to all housing units that will bind the applicant, any assignee, mortgagee, or buyer, and all other parties that receive title to the property. The grantor must state in any deed or instrument conveying title to an R-HOP housing unit, that the property conveyed is intended to be housing for older persons and is subject to the restrictions contained in this Section. No covenant referencing any of the regulations or restrictions herein for a housing for older persons housing
unit shall be recorded until and unless said covenant contains restrictions approved by the Director of Planning and Development that are consistent with the requirements of this Section. Such review and response shall be completed within thirty (30) calendar days following date of submission of such documents to the Director of Planning and Development.

Concept Plan Review for the R-HOP Districts

All rezoning applications for the R-HOP districts shall be accompanied by a concept plan in compliance with the requirements of the R-HOP district(s). The Planning Department has reviewed the conceptual site plan/preliminary plat, entitled Summit Chase Overall Site Plan”, sealed, signed and dated 3-1-2019 and sample building elevations/photos and determined that the applicant has met the required submittal requirements.

Rezoning Site Plan

The rezoning site plan entitled “Summit Chase Overall Site Plan”, dated March 1, 2019 (stamped received March 12, 2019) shows the proposed subdivision development including: layout plan for 257 single-family lots (lots 258-280 future phase), private streets and cul-de-sacs; gated ingress/egress drives on Rosebud Road; stormwater detention/water quality areas; and open space amenity areas.

The proposed site plan, submitted by the applicant.
The proposed development is essentially split into two sections by Rosebud Road, with Lots 1-105 on the eastern side of Rosebud Road, just north of Temple Johnson Road and to the west of Brushy Fork Road, where holes 3-6 currently exist; and Lots 106-257 on the western side of Rosebud Road, just north of Temple Johnson Road, where holes 1-2 and 7-9 currently exist. There are two entrances along Rosebud Road, which will be aligned, and will both be gated or have a guard house. The applicant intends to keep the existing golf cart tunnel under Rosebud to allow residents access from one side of the development to the other.

There is a large amenity and open space area depicted in the central west portion of the property, though the site plan does not specify what kind of amenities will be located there or the proposed layout. There is also a greyed out 5.70± acre portion of the property on the southwest corner labeled “Future Phase” indicating plans for the potential expansion of the development for Lots 258-280. This “Future Phase” area is not part of this rezoning or land use plan amendment request and will require a separate application submittal and public hearing approval.

Although no structures are shown on the plan, it appears the lot layout, open space and detention pond locations comply with the seventy-five foot (75’) buffer requirement of the City’s Stream Buffer Protection Ordinance along the stream buffer bank in the northwest corner of the property.

The applicant is proposing three (3) typical lots layouts, all one-hundred-twenty feet (120’) in depth but varying in width from fifty-sixty-seventy feet (50’-60’-70’), respectively.

Sample Building Elevations

The applicant has provided sample building elevations in the form of photos of similar type home sites that have been built to demonstrate the look that they are hoping to achieve with this development. The applicant is requesting a variance from the R-HOP Architectural Design Standards to reduce the requirement that homes be constructed of no less than seventy percent (70%) brick and/or stone for each building elevation. They are proposing three (3) variants for front elevations, ranging from seventy percent (70%) brick or stone to only having a brick or stone water table (see Variance Analysis).

**VARIANCE ANALYSIS**

The applicant is requesting the following variances from the R-HOP District requirements of the Snellville Zoning Ordinance:
1. Variance from Section 9.19, R-HOP(55)-SF District: Minimum side yard building setback of five-feet (5’), with a minimum of at least fifteen-feet (15’) feet between buildings.

Request to allow a minimum building separation of ten-feet (10’) between buildings, measured at the foundation.

In the words of the applicant, this variance is to “minimize exterior yard maintenance cost, fees and assessments to homeowners since all exterior lots are commonly maintained by the HOA.”

The general trend in homebuilding has been a growing preference for little or no yards in many new developments, both in urban and suburban neighborhoods. This is supported by development seen in the City, which has had many similar requests over the years with support by the City including: Stockton Walk, Carrington Village, Old Hickory Village, Preserve at Briscoe, Newton’s Crest, Skylars Mill, Crimson Creek, Governors Walk, as well as newer developments like Shadowbrook (next to Eastside Hospital) and Saddlebrook, an age-restricted community at the corner of Ridgedale and Pinehurst.

This variance is recommended for approval.

2. Section 9.18(1)(D), R-HOP Site and Architectural Design Standards: Homes/buildings shall be constructed of traditional design with brick, stone, masonry horizontal siding, and masonry shakes/shingles. Brick and/or stone shall constitute no less than seventy percent (70%) of the materials used, with accents of masonry siding or shakes/shingles for each building elevation.

Request to allow a percentage of proposed homes have the following building elevation configurations:

a. Forty-five percent (45%) of the units shall have a front façade composed of cedar shake accent with three-foot (3’) masonry/brick water table. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.

b. Forty-Five percent (45%) of the units shall have a front façade composed of cedar shake accent with thirty percent (30%) brick/masonry accent. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.

c. Ten percent (10%) of the units shall have a front façade of cedar shake with seventy Percent (70%) brick/masonry. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.

The rationale behind this variance is simply to allow greater flexibility and façade treatment options for the prospective homeowners, as well as lowering material costs for the builder. It also provides for more architectural diversity in the neighborhood by
allowing a variety of front façade options instead of having the street lined with houses containing front façades of only brick or stone.

Similar variances have been granted to other like developments in the City. Most recently, a variance very similar to this one was granted to Century Communities in 2018 (ANX 18-01 RZ 18-03 LUP 18-01), for their Saddlebrook development. That approved variance reads as follows:

“To reduce the requirement that homes be constructed of no less than 70% brick and/or stone for each building elevation so that the front elevation will have no less than 10% brick and/or stone and the sides and rear will be constructed using cement siding with a combination of cement shakes, board and batten, and siding.”

This variance is recommended for approval.

CONCLUSION AND STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

In conclusion, the requested land use plan amendment and rezoning are supported by the recently adopted Snellville 2040 Comprehensive Plan. The addition of an age-restricted residential development of this scope will be a highly sought-after addition to the City’s repertoire of housing, as Snellville has been a little late to providing age-restricted developments of this type. It will also introduce more diversity of housing options while retaining the single-family detached character of the immediate area. The requested variances are reasonable and provide the developer/builder greater flexibility and options to homebuyers and will not detract from existing dwellings in the area.

In conclusion, the Department of Planning and Development recommends the following actions for the 75.29± acre property located on Rosebud Road, (Parcels 5093 106, 5094 161, 5099 180):

- Approval of LUP 19-01, application to amend the City of Snellville 2040 Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use Map from Park/Recreation to Low Density Residential.

- Approval of RZ 19-02, application to amend the City of Snellville Official Zoning Map from RS-180 (Single-family Residence) District to R-HOP(55)-SF, (Single-family Residential Housing for Older Persons) District.

In conjunction with the rezoning of the property, the following variances (1-2) are recommended for Approval:

1. Section 9.19, R-HOP (55) SF District: To reduce the minimum separation distance between buildings from fifteen-feet (15’) to ten-feet (10’), measured at the foundation.
2. Section 9.18(1)(D), R-HOP Site and Architectural Design Standards: Homes/buildings shall be constructed of traditional design with brick, stone, masonry horizontal siding, and masonry shakes/shingles. Brick and/or stone shall constitute no less than 70 percent of the materials used, with accents of masonry siding or shakes/shingles for each building elevation. Instead, to allow for a percentage of proposed homes to have the following configurations:
   a. Forty-five percent (45%) of the units shall have a front façade composed of cedar shake accent with three-foot (3’) masonry/brick water table. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.
   b. Forty-Five percent (45%) of the units shall have a front façade composed of cedar shake accent with thirty percent (30%) brick/masonry accent. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.
   c. Ten percent (10%) of the units shall have a front façade of cedar shake with seventy Percent (70%) brick/masonry. Side and rear elevations shall be constructed of stained/painted cedar shake and/or cement board siding.

These recommendations of approval are subject to the following recommended Conditions:

1. The property shall be developed in accordance with the rezoning site plan entitled “Summit Chase Overall Site Plan”, dated 3-1-2019 (stamped received 3-22-2019), attached hereto as Exhibit “A” and incorporated herein by reference, with modifications permitted due to engineering restraints, ingress and egress, and/or to meet conditions of zoning or State, County, and City regulations. Substantial variation from the rezoning site plan, as determined by the Director of Planning and Development will require Mayor and Council approval;

2. Single-family detached dwellings shall not exceed a density of 3.41 units per acre. The project is to be deed restricted to ownership by residents aged 55 years of age or older;

3. Stormwater detention facility(s) shall be fenced with either a black vinyl-coated chain link fence a minimum of four feet in height, or 6-8-foot-tall privacy fence;

4. Signs higher than 15 feet and larger than 225 sq. ft. in area are prohibited;

5. All corner lots and lots abutting an external public street shall be designated as “High Visibility Lots” and require a continuation of the front façade treatments to the corner side to continue the architectural theme that is presented on the front elevation to the corner elevation exposed to public view;

6. There shall be master protective covenants for the entire development that will include all phases of the development (recreation/amenity and residential) and such
other usual and necessary covenants and restrictions to protect the quality and integrity of the single-family development;

7. A mandatory homeowner’s association shall be formed and incorporated for all single-family lots in the development and common areas which will include all component parts of the proposed development. The Homeowners’ Association shall be responsible for the oversight, upkeep, maintenance and repair of all common areas/facilities; private streets; curb and gutter; stormwater detention facilities, including detention ponds, underground pipe/structures, catch basins, headwalls and manholes; street frontage and amenity area landscaping; gated entrance areas; ground signage; walls and fencing; open space areas; amenities including tennis court, swimming pool, clubhouse, walking trails and other amenities, and the like contained within the overall development, and maintain adequate liability insurance and working capital;

8. The Homeowners’ Association shall be responsible for the exterior maintenance of individual residences to include, at a minimum, painting of the exteriors on a rotation not to exceed ten (10) years;

9. A Residential Drainage Plan (RDP) shall be submitted for review and approval by the Director of Planning and development for those lots so designated on the Final Plat prior to issuance of a building permit;

10. A no-access easement shall be provided on the side and rear of all lots abutting Rosebud Road, Temple Johnson Road, and Brushy Fork Road.

11. All driveways shall be a minimum of twenty-two feet (22’) in length, measured from the front of the garage door to the leading edge of the sidewalk, and shall be wide enough to accommodate the parallel parking of two vehicles;

12. All streets shall be privately owned and maintained by the Homeowners’ Association;

13. All approved zoning conditions and variances shall be referenced on any plat of a lot provided to homebuyers; and

14. Non-substantial variances, as determined by the Director of Planning and Development and/or City Manager for the design requirements, zoning requirements, development regulations, and construction requirements must be submitted in writing for administrative approval with the Director of Planning and Development.